

Public-Private Partnerships for Sustainable Tourism in Batangas Province, Philippines

Ryan Joseph G. Calinao

College of International Tourism and Hospitality Management,
Lyceum of the Philippines University-Laguna, Philippines
ryanjoseph.calinao@lpulaguna.edu.ph

**Asia Pacific Journal of
Multidisciplinary Research**

Vol. 8 No.2, 70-77

May 2020

P-ISSN 2350-7756

E-ISSN 2350-8442

www.apjmr.com

ASEAN Citation Index

Date Received: March 12, 2020; Date Revised: April 20, 2020

***Abstract**-Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) has drawn the Philippines from an image of investments and Asia's rising star to its golden age of infrastructure. This study verified the respondent's awareness in tourism plans and programs of different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas; assess the PPP implementation in tourism sector; confirm the significant factors that contribute to a successful PPP in terms of socio-cultural, economic, environmental, political, and legal thru the assessment of awareness and implementation of public and private sectors. Descriptive research was used to determine the factors that may contribute to the formulations of PPP framework. Linear regression analysis was also used to determine the significant factors for a successful PPP. It was concluded that most of the respondents are moderately aware of the tourism plans and programs of the province and there was a moderate implementation of PPP projects in the province which is not under the tourism sector. Public sector predictors are economic and legal, while private sectors predictors are also economic, legal, and environmental under awareness in tourism plans and programs. For assessment of implementation; public predictors are same from the previous result while for private predictors are economic, legal, political and socio-cultural. Primary framework was created for the upcoming implementation of PPP for tourism sector of the Province.*

***Keywords** –public private partnerships, PPP framework, tourism sector*

INTRODUCTION

Tourism is an essential and significant industry in the Philippines because its contribution to the economy. The development of tourism in across the country from different metropolis, regions and provinces covers the gulf for tourism infrastructure to propel. Philippine tourism is diverse industry embracing an extensive range of economic activities, as key contributor to the future generation of the country's gross domestic product, revenues and ventures.

When it comes to investment in the tourism sector, it is not always after the structures of different lodging sectors such as hotels, restaurants, casinos, and entertainment city to name a few, but also is the transport sectors which regenerates the growth of tourism industry as such airports, railways, sea ports, and telecommunication lines are part of the territorial asset. In particular, to the fact that the public sector has a limitation more exact to the Philippines as one of the developing countries, it prevents the extensive ventures in this industry [1],[2].

This study aims to strengthen the regulations of tourism sector in Batangas Province and be a catalyst

of improvement of tourism plans and programs more particularly in the coastal and inland areas represented by different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas through the help of public and private partnerships that will enable people to travel more efficiently, appreciate the culture and promote the development and sustainability of tourism sector of the province.

It also identifies the significant role of Batangas Provincial Tourism office on its mandate to implement different programs and projects to enhance tourism in the province thru this research with respect to Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) on tourism sector. In addition, the private sector which generally comprises the different hospitality, lodging, and food & beverage businesses together with the recognized contractors of the government plays also a significant role on this research as they belong in the development of superstructures and of different livelihoods of the host community.

Moreover, the researcher strongly believed that getting awareness on this aspect can shed light to the future plans relative to the improvement of tourism in Batangas through the proposed framework of PPP in

the tourism sector. This is also a call to the province to initiate the PPP in tourism development as the only partnerships that the province has is the PPP for the environmental sector.

Lastly, in line with the trifocal function of the university and the researcher's institution, which aims to produce internationally competitive graduates who will be able to contribute in the growth and enrichment of tourism industry more also to the international hospitality management program of the country. This research was conceptualized to benefit and expand the tourism sector with the vision which is dedicated to the sustainable tourism development through PPP framework.

Different researchers from local and international body made an emphasis to the Province of Batangas as this sits the center of the center of the worlds marine biodiversity known to be as the heart of the coral triangle of the planet, more specifically in the Southeast Asian region. Many transportation projects such as the Southern Tagalog Arterial Road (STAR) toll way that connects from the country's capital-Manila going straight to Batangas province were built under the PPP which answers the call of the increasing visits of local and international tourist.

Another response to the call of the sustainable development in the area is the different transportation sites that were built such as the Philippine Ports Authority (PPA) in Batangas City and the Bauan International Port, Inc. (BIPI) in Bauan to support the transportation industry and soon to open the PPA for some visits in the next coming years which was pioneered by the Port of Manila, Boracay in Visayas and Laoag in the northern Luzon. Meanwhile in 2015, arrivals by sea summed to 3,847 arrivals, of which, Batangas port recorded 1,312 arrivals followed by the port in Davao with 1,208 arrivals that means there is a positive impact in the said transportation development [3].

Lastly, different hospitality businesses gained popular response to the rapid shift of the tourism sector in the province that caters the needs for entertainment, foods, lodging and adventures such as the investments of international hotel brand, and the investment of foreign businessman in each tourism sites in the province. Thus, this development shall focus in sustainability of the tourism sector in reference to the upcoming plan of the province which is to adopt the PPP in order to achieve its long-run objectives.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This study aims to foster the development of sustainable tourism through Public-Private Partnership's initial framework in the Province of Batangas. More specifically to:

Verify the level of awareness of the respondents in tourism plans and programs of their respective municipalities and cities; assess the PPP implementation in the tourism sector of the different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas Province; confirm the factors that contribute to a successful PPP in the tourism sector in the Province of Batangas in terms of: Socio-Cultural, Economic, Environmental, Political, and Legal; determine the significant factors of a successful PPP through assessment of awareness and implementation of public and private sectors; and to propose an initial clear-cut framework for PPP to the Province of Batangas.

METHODS

The researcher used descriptive type of research to determine the factors that may contribute to the formulation of PPP framework in the tourism sector of the province of Batangas by using survey questionnaire and an open-ended with follow-up questions.

The researcher divided the public and private sector in terms of qualifications, hundred percent respondents for the tourism offices, planning and development office of each first-class municipalities and cities of the province, five from Local Government Unit (LGU), and at least ten community members within the municipality as represented by the public sector. Meanwhile five to ten resorts, hotels, restaurants or any available accredited lodging, food and beverage establishment owner or manager served as respondents and a representative of different contractor companies in the province represented the private sector.

The qualifiers for the host community are the top 3 three destinations recognized by each tourism or planning and development offices of the municipality or city. Meanwhile for the private sector, it was represented by different hospitality and lodging businesses that are accredited by the same accrediting body of each municipality or city. For another group under private sector, qualified contractors were subject to availability and approval of each company thru the help of the LGUs. The qualified contractors

and available in the Province are Atlantic Gulf and Pacific Company (AG&P) and EEI Corporation.

Total number of the respondents were 587 from the private group and 965 from the public group with a total of 1552.

The main instrument that was used in this study is a self-made questionnaire constructed by the researcher using the updated review of related literature with proper citations. The questionnaire was validated by the statistician together with the three panelists and the Department of Tourism Region IV-A representative. The researcher made a pilot test for 30 individuals who are not included in the survey proper. Below is the result of the Cronbach's Alpha:

Table A. Cronbach's Alpha Result

Sub-Indicators	Cronbach's Alpha	Interpretation
Level of Awareness	0.934	Excellent
Level of Assessment	0.863	Good
Economic Factor	0.909	Excellent
Socio-Cultural Factor	0.873	Good
Environmental Factor	0.803	Good
Political Factor	0.844	Good
Legal Factor	0.831	Good

Rules of thumb: "> 0.90 – Excellent; > 0.80 – Good; > 0.70 – Acceptable; > 0.60 – Questionable; > 0.50 – Poor; < 0.50 – Unacceptable

The questionnaire was distributed using random sampling technique for the host community from the public sector and convenience sampling for the private sector due to the availability of different establishments and contractors in each of the municipalities and cities of the province. The researcher secured the discretion of the survey questionnaires since the identities are not vital.

The researcher also ensured that the information about the respondents of this study will be protected and privately secured. Moreover, the researcher addressed the procedure about writing the study. The data should be secured and private the researcher avoided any offensive, discriminatory, and other unacceptable language in interview, focus group discussion and questionnaire and also the privacy of the respondents.

The gathered data were tallied, tabulated, encoded, and analyzed accordingly with the use of the following statistical tools/methods.

Weighted mean was used in the scale to find out the average means, based on the respondent's awareness of tourism plans and programs of the

different municipalities and cities of Batangas Province, assessment of PPP implementation in the tourism sector of the Province of Batangas, and the possible factors that may contribute to a successful PPP.

Linear regression analysis used to determine the significant factor through PPP implementation, assessment, and involvement of public and private sectors. The given scale was used to interpret the result of the data gathered in terms of awareness: 3.50 – 4.00 = Extremely Aware (EA); 2.50 – 3.49 = Moderately Aware (MA); 1.50 – 2.49 = Slightly Not Aware (SNA); 1.00 – 1.49 = Not Aware (NA). The given scale was used to interpret the PPP implementation: 3.50 – 4.00 = Extremely Implemented (EI); 2.50 – 3.49 = Moderately Implemented (MI); 1.50 – 2.49 = Slightly Not Implemented (SNI); 1.00 – 1.49 = Not Implemented (NI).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1. Awareness of Tourism Plans and Programs in the First-Class Municipalities and Cities of Batangas Private Sector

Indicators	Private (N = 587)		
	WM	VI	R
1. current programs for PPP for tourism	2.39	SNA	12
2. website of tourism sector	2.47	SNA	11
3. annual celebration or festival	3.00	MA	1
4. campaign slogan for tourism	2.82	MA	3
5. promotion of local products/services	2.84	MA	2
6. tourism information center	2.62	MA	8
7. tourism infrastructure development	2.63	MA	7
8. consultative body on tourism industry	2.54	MA	9
9. billboards/signage for tourism/culture	2.49	SNA	10
10. campaign materials for promotion	2.70	MA	5
11. road signs/roadmaps for tourism spot	2.80	MA	4
12. signs & placards for safety & security	2.66	MA	6
Composite Mean	2.66	MA	

It can be gleaned from Table 1 the private sector agreed that there is an annual celebration or festival in the different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas that showcase the culture, products and highlights of every municipalities (3.00) which also got the highest rank. Private sectors in terms of celebrations or fiesta in respected municipalities and cities in Batangas are moderately aware of this plans and programs of the Batangas province, also private sectors such as hotels, motels or any other lodging institutions together with food and beverages

establishments around the are more participative on this projects by means of acknowledging and joining in float parades and other events during the said festivals.

Some appropriate examples are float parades during the annual Sublian Festivals in the Municipality of Bauan and City of Batangs in the honor of Mahal naPoong Sta Cruz and Sto. Niño of Batangan, City of Lights Parade in Tanauan City and religious festivals in Lipa City whereas some of the private lodging establishments offers promos and other bargain products and services.

Table 2. Awareness of Tourism Plans and Programs in the First-Class Municipalities and Cities of Batangas Public Sector

Indicators	Public (N = 965)		
	WM	VI	R
1. current programs for PPP for tourism	2.47	SNA	12
2. website of tourism sector	2.63	MA	11
3. annual celebration or festival	3.02	MA	1
4. campaign slogan for tourism	2.78	MA	6
5. promotion of local products/services	2.88	MA	2
6. tourism information center	2.87	MA	3
7. tourism infrastructure development	2.75	MA	8
8. consultative body on tourism industry	2.76	MA	7
9. billboards/signage for tourism/culture	2.66	MA	10
10. campaign materials for promotion	2.72	MA	9
11. road signs/roadmaps for tourism spot	2.85	MA	4
12. signs & placards for safety & security	2.80	MA	5
Composite Mean	2.76	MA	

Same result, as from the public sector agreed also that there is annual celebration or festival in the different first-class municipalities and cities (3.00) which also ranked the highest. Public group is well represented by the residents from different municipalities and cities of Batangas province. It ranked first due to most of the residents are participative during festivals and fiestas of each barangay or barrios honored to the patron saint of their place, moreover Batangueños are very delighted to celebrate fiestas and festivals and in joining parades.

Based from the result of Table 1, both private (2.39) and public (2.47) sectors are not aware of the current programs regarding the Public-Private Partnership in tourism sector which ranked the least. The indicators give a near factual result due to the said programs in terms of tourism sector is concerned may not be properly disseminated and the private sector are much focused on the profitability of their business.

Common result may have raised also due to unavailability of PPP projects in Batangas Province, this could be supported the former chairperson of Provincial Tourism, Culture, and the Arts Office (PTCAO) of Batangas Province that PPP in tourism sector is not yet implemented in the province and only environmental sector has the support on the said project.

Table 3. PPP implementation in the Tourism sector of Batangas- Private Sector

Indicators	Private		
	WM	VI	R
1. There are PPP projects in the tourism sectors in Municipality	2.35	SNI	7
2. There are Hi-ways that are constructed	2.78	MI	4.5
3. There are Tourism spots that are owned by a certain private	2.83	MI	1
4. There is alternative way, route, or hub for tourist transport	2.78	MI	4.5
5. There are safety instruments such as reflector, lights/lighthouses	2.69	MI	6
6. There are some accommodations such as hotels, and resorts	2.82	MI	2
7. There is a solid waste management system	2.80	MI	3
Composite Mean	2.72	MI	

It can be gleaned from Table 3 that there is a moderate implementation in terms of tourism spots that are owned by a certain private individual in different Municipalities (2.83) which also ranked first to as private sector is concerned. This is also directly proportional to the business that they owned that rationally reflects on the tourism sector side. It was supported by which the said indicator agreed that it is moderately implemented because most private individuals venture into different tourism businesses in the coastal municipalities of Batangas [4].

In terms of public sector, there is alternative way, route, or hub for tourist transport and to access the tourist site in the given area of destination which is moderately implemented (2.94) got the highest ranked from the public sector, and a moderate implementation of Hi-ways that are constructed to boost the economy, the travel and tourism industry of municipality (2.88) ranked third. This can be explained by the implementation of PPP in terms of infrastructure such the STAR Tollway Corporation that links the country's prime economic hub-greater Manila direct to the Province of Batangas. In addition,

the presence of PPA in Batangas City and the BIPI makes the province more accessible for the diverse transaction such as the transport of goods, native products, other livelihood, tourism products and the transfer of people from Batangas going straight to different parts of the country thru the said seaports. Lastly, the addition of the road widening projects of different national roads such as the AH26 (Pan Philippine High-way) in Sto. Tomas, Batangas as the national primary road, the national secondary road which links smaller cities and provincial capitals, airports, seaports, and tourist centers to the primary roads, and the national tertiary roads.

Table 4. Assessment of the PPP implementation in the Tourism sector of Batangas- Public Sector

Indicators	Public		
	WM	VI	R
1. There are PPP projects in the tourism sectors in Municipality	2.55	MI	7
2. There are Hi-ways that are constructed	2.88	MI	3
3. There are Tourism spots that are owned by a certain private	2.87	MI	4
4. There is alternative way, route, or hub for tourist transport	2.94	MI	1
5. There are safety instruments such as reflector, lights/lighthouses	2.84	MI	6
6. There are some accommodations such as hotels, and resorts	2.91	MI	2
7. There is a solid waste management system	2.84	MI	5
Composite Mean	2.83	MI	

It can be gleaned also from Tables 3 and 4 for both private and public that PPP projects are moderately implemented in the tourism sectors in different Municipalities of Batangas (2.55) ranked the least with for public sector. For private sector (2.35) PPP projects are also slightly not implemented.

The manifestation of the projects for roads and other infrastructures are not duly categorized under the PPP for tourism that is the reason why the representatives or the group from private sector rated it as slightly not implemented. In addition, proper dissemination of information for both sectors are lacking and really do not know that particular project is under PPP.

Based on the interviews conducted by the researcher within the workers of tourism industry (beach resorts, restaurants, and hotel) under the private sector they are not able to make use of the PPP

projects in different cities and municipalities of Batangas. Different infrastructures and safety instruments are moderately implemented in coastal municipalities. According to the workers under tourism industry, construction of different infrastructures can boost the economy by simply attracting more tourists.

Also, based from the interviews from the host community, the owners of the establishments and some private contractors do not know the term PPP and if some of them know it, they cannot say also that it is for the tourism sector though the implementation is in slight level. The implementation of PPP for Public sector was affected by the awareness of tourism plans and programs together with the knowledge of the people for PPP projects for tourism sector.

Table 5. Summary Table on the Factors in the Development of the Tourism Framework through the PPP (Public-Private Partnership) in the First-Class Municipalities and Cities of Batangas Province

Indicators	Private			Public		
	WM	VI	R	WM	VI	R
1. Economic	2.90	A	2.5	2.91	A	2
2. Socio-Cultural	2.76	A	5	2.83	A	5
3. Environmental	2.81	A	4	2.84	A	4
4. Political	2.90	A	2.5	2.91	A	2
5. Legal	2.94	A	1	2.91	A	2
Composite Mean	2.86	A		2.88	A	

Legend: 3.50 – 4.00 = Strongly Agree (SA); 2.50 – 3.49 = Agree (A); 1.50 – 2.49 = Disagree (D); 1.00 – 1.49 = Strongly Disagree (SD)

From Table 5, private sector column reveals that among of the given five factors, legal got the highest rank with a weighted mean of 2.94 and a verbal interpretation of agree. This means that a legal or procedural law that binds the PPP is one of the key factors for a successful PPP that the private sectors are concerned about. This is due that most of the Private sectors are concerned with the legal binding that they are about to venture or invest with the government that directly proportional towards the community where the possible project will be implemented.

Moreover, Economic and Political factors (2.90) ranked 2.5 and this can be elaborated by such in a way that political is directly proportional to the economic policy of a certain community towards the private sector is concerned. The policy based from the leadership of a certain political allies could affect the

economy as the other factors in establishing the PPP is concerned.

This shows that when venturing a business in the community host is crucial due to the political climate that is rooted among the leaders and economic growth may be affected also, in addition environmental factor from the same sector got a ranked 4 out of 5 with a mean value and verbal interpretation as 2.81-agree.

Lastly, Socio-cultural got the lowest ranked in the private sector column with 2.76 weighted mean and verbal interpretation of agree. The table shows that most of the businesses under the said sector are not much focused on the social and cultural aspects of the area and most, legal and profitability of a certain businesses might be a foreign reason behind the said ranking.

From the same table, under Public sector column shows that three out of five factors, namely economic, political and legal got the same ranked of two with the same mean of 2.91 with verbal interpretation of agree. The result gained perpendicular outcome because if economic might affect by the political factors that surrounds the community and the community host, might as well as legal factors that binds the PPP projects for tourism sector.

Inasmuch as the political barriers in the community are concerned, the eight barriers were enumerated to economic growth in the United States yet only government interferes is the highlight and is proportional to political factor by explaining that it inferences with growth by impeding competition and distorting economic incentives [5]. It distorts the signal that individuals send markets about their preferences and adds a great deal of noise and cost, which distorts economic activity from being its most efficient.

Table 6 shows that the factors legal, economic, environmental and socio-cultural were found to be the predictors of a successful PPP through assessment of awareness. This was revealed by the r-value of 0.517 which indicates a moderate degree of correlation. In addition, 26.70% is explained by the independent variable (awareness of tourism plans and programs) the total variation in PPP. Also, the computed p-value under F-test was less than 0.05 and indicates that, over-all, the regression models statistically predicts the outcome variables.

The coefficient table shows that when the factors such as legal, economic, environmental and socio-cultural were combine contributes statistically significant to the model, thus considered the best

predictors.

Table 6. Predictors of a Successful PPP through Assessment of Awareness of Public and Private Sectors

Model	UC		SC		T	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta			
1 (Constant)	1.268	0.052			24.493	0.000
legal	0.482	0.024	0.454		20.035	0.000
2 (Constant)	1.034	0.055			18.914	0.000
legal	0.311	0.028	0.293		10.977	0.000
economic	0.283	0.027	0.282		10.566	0.000
3 (Constant)	0.972	0.058			16.853	0.000
legal	0.283	0.029	0.267		9.609	0.000
economic	0.237	0.030	0.236		7.858	0.000
environment	0.100	0.031	0.096		3.264	0.001
4 (Constant)	0.922	0.061			15.166	0.000
legal	0.267	0.030	0.251		8.870	0.000
economic	0.203	0.033	0.203		6.203	0.000
environment	0.082	0.031	0.078		2.608	0.009
Socio-cultural	0.088	0.034	0.080		2.564	0.010

F-value = 141.083; R = 0.517; R² = 0.267

Table 7. Predictors of a Successful PPP through Assessment of Implementation of Public and Private Sectors

Model	UC		SC		t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta			
1 (Constant)	1.147	0.049			23.538	0.000
economic	0.515	0.023	0.501		22.810	0.000
2 (Constant)	0.889	0.055			16.264	0.000
economic	0.370	0.027	0.360		13.830	0.000
legal	0.268	0.028	0.247		9.473	0.000
3 (Constant)	0.790	0.057			13.829	0.000
economic	0.303	0.029	0.295		10.352	0.000
legal	0.202	0.031	0.186		6.584	0.000
political	0.180	0.033	0.160		5.413	0.000
4 (Constant)	0.723	0.060			11.956	0.000
economic	0.257	0.032	0.250		7.960	0.000
legal	0.182	0.031	0.167		5.843	0.000
political	0.160	0.034	0.143		4.754	0.000
Socio-cultural	0.113	0.034	0.100		3.349	0.001

F-value = 141.083; R = 0.517; R² = 0.267

Table 7 shows that the factors economic, legal, political and socio-cultural were found to be the predictors of a successful PPP through assessment of implementation. This was revealed by the r-value of 0.557 which indicates a moderate degree of correlation. In addition, 31.10% is explained by the independent variable (implementation) the total

variation in PPP. Also, the computed p-value under F-test was less than 0.05 and indicates that, over-all, the regression models statistically predicts the outcome variables.

The coefficient table shows that when the factors such as economic, legal, political and socio-cultural were combine contributes statistically significant to the model, thus considered the best predictors. The management of the risk associated with PPP projects is very important to the success of the project. This is confirmed by earlier studies [6]-[9], and it is therefore, the public sector should ensure that the appropriate risk is allocated to the party best suited to manage such risk [10]. Another important factor for the success of PPP projects is the availability of sound economic policy by the political leaders. This factor gives direction to the development of the economy and provides an environment conducive to the implementation of PPP projects.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Most of the respondents are moderately aware in terms of the awareness of tourism plans and programs of different municipalities and cities of Batangas. But some of those particularly the private sector is slightly not aware in terms of the billboards and signage promoting culture and tourism of Batangas.

In terms of assessment of implementation of PPP in tourism sector of different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas Province more specifically the infrastructures and other lodging businesses are moderately implemented. Moreover, only PPP projects in the tourism sector of each municipalities and cities are slightly implemented.

Both sectors are agreed on most indicators of the five factors that may contribute to a successful PPP but only one indicator from the economic factor got disagree that Tourism improvement can cause exploitation of local residents such as using them for cheap labour under the private sector.

The significant factors that may contribute to a successful PPP projects in tourism sector are divided in each sectors and variables. First dependent variable is the awareness of the respondents in tourism plans and programs for public sector, the predictors are economic and legal, and for the private sector are also economic and legal factors together with the environmental factor. Second dependent variable is the assessment of implementation of PPP in tourism sector of different first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas Province for public sector, the predictors

are economic and legal, and for the private sector, are the economic, legal, political and socio-cultural factors.

The Province of Batangas may review their tourism plans and programs thru the different tourism offices or planning and development offices of each cities and municipalities to address the awareness of the respective and relevant programs and its implementation in the host community and with the participation of different private sectors.

The Province of Batangas in the upcoming implementation of the PPP projects in tourism sector, may review the factors that appear to be significant in this study and focused on how to strengthen and enhance the current programs under each factor and develop appropriate tourism programs which are not yet implemented thru PPP.

Proposed initial or primary framework may be use for the upcoming implementation of PPP for tourism sector however, it is only limited to the first-class municipalities and cities of Batangas Province.

REFERENCES

- [1] Teker, S. &Dilek, T. (2012). Tourism projects financing: a public private model.*Business Management Dynamics*,2(5), 5-11.Retrieved from <http://hrmars.com>
- [2] Haddadi, M. &Khodadadpoor, M. (2015). The role of public-private partnership contracts in tourism industry development. *International Journal of Academic Research in Economics and Management Sciences*, 4(1). Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.6007/ijarems/v4-i1/1628>
- [3] Department of Tourism. (2015).*Tourism statistics in 2015, industry performance for travel and tourism*. Retrieved from: <http://www.tourism.gov.ph/pages/industryperformance.aspx>
- [4] Sagario, B. &Tuiza, C. (2017). Analysing the public-private partnership implementation in the tourism sector in coastal municipalities of Batangas. *LPU-L Journal of Tourism and Hospitality Management*.
- [5] Mauldin, J. (2016, March 14). *The 8 biggest barriers to economic growth*. Retrieved from Forbes: <https://goo.gl/DvFzQj>
- [6] Li, B., Akintoye, A., Edwards, P.J., & Hardcastle, C. (2005). Critical success factors for PPP/PFI projects in the UK construction industry. *Construction Management and Economics*, 23(5), pp.459-71. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01446190500041537>
- [7] Zhang, X. (2015). Critical success factors for public-private partnerships in infrastructure development. Retrieved from <http://www.ipd.org.vn/uploads/54599-critical-success-factors-.pdf> 7

- [8] Cheung, E., Chan, A. P.C., &Kajewski, S., (2012). Factors contributing to successful public private partnership projects: Comparing Hong Kong with Australia and the United Kingdom. *Journal of Facilities Management*, 10(1), 45-58. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/14725961211200397> 8
- [9] Wibowo, A. &Alfen, H. W. (2014). Identifying macro-environmental critical success factors and key areas for improvement to promote public-private partnerships in infrastructure. *Engineering, Construction and Architectural Management*, 21(4), 383–402. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/ECAM-08-2013-0078> 9
- [10] Sanni, A. O. (2016). Factors determining the success of public private partnership projects in Nigeria. *Construction Economics and Building*, 16(2), 42. doi:10.5130/ajceb.v16i2.4828 10

COPYRIGHTS

Copyright of this article is retained by the author/s, with first publication rights granted to APJMR. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4>).